



INDICATORS Mayor, Directors Municipal Assembly Budget Free Access to Information Public Tenders Donations and Contracts' Public Enterprises and Public Administration Relations with the Civil Society Urban Planning Municipal Ownership 800



March 2018



MUNICIPAL TRANSPARENCY REFORM INDEX



This report has been prepared as part of "Promoting social integration and reconciliation in Kosovo" project, financially supported by the British Embassy in Pristina and administered through OSCE Mission in Kosovo (OMIK). The content (or findings and recommendations) expressed herein are responsibility of the authors and ACDC and do not reflect the views of the British Embassy or OMIK.

Publisher: Advocacy Center for Democratic Culture Editor: Srdjan Simonovic Head of Research: Aleksandar Djukic Researchers: Aleksa Aleksic, Danilo Vasic Authors of municipal chapters: Milena Ilijevska, Jovana Jakovljevic Design and layout: Milos Kabasic

Table of Contents Introduction	
Kosovo Northern municipalities	
Methodology	7
Indicators	8
Zubin Potok	11
Mayor, Municipal Assembly, Directors	11
Budget	
Free Access to Information	13
Public Procurement Donation and Contracts	13
Public Enterprises and Public Administration	
Relations with Civil Society	15
Urban Planning	16
Municipal Property	16
North Mitrovica	
Mayor, Municipal Assembly, Directors	
Budget	19
Free Access to Information	
Public Procurement Donation and Contracts	20
Public Enterprises and Public Administration	
Relations with Civil Society	22
Urban Planning	
Municipal Property	23
Leposavic	24
Mayor, Municipal Assembly, Directors	24
Budget	25
Free Access to Information	
Public Procurement Donation and Contracts	
Public Enterprises and Public Administration	
Relations with Civil Society	
Urban Planning	
Municipal Property	
Zvecan	

Mayor, Municipal Assembly, Directors	30
Budget	31
Free Access to Information	32
Public Procurement Donation and Contracts	32
Public Enterprises and Public Administration	33
Relations with Civil Society	34
Urban Planning	34
Municipal Property	35

INTRODUCTION

In 2011, a multi-sector coalition of the Open Government Partnership was formed, in order to improve transparency and accountability at the state level, especially at the level of governments¹.

Part of the responsibility belonged to the local governments, and it became necessary for transparency² to be improved at that level as well. There are more and more verified practices that emerged out as a model of monitoring transparency and integrity of local self government³, as well as specific solutions to improve the integrity and transparency at the level of the city.

Already now we can talk about an enviable knowledge base and practice available to the public officials, local politicians who are eager to reform their municipalities in the field of transparency and integrity, as well as civil society, and the academic community.

Knowledge and practice are no longer a problem. The integrity of those who want to change and those who have the need and desire to reform the municipalities in the field of integrity and transparency is at the exam.

The minimum that proponents of reforms in the area of transparency must put in front of themselves is: the publication of annual work plans of the institution; development of a plan of holding regular sessions of local assemblies; publication and dissemination of materials, as well as the acts approved by the local assembly, council and mayor; involvement of the public and citizens in the work of the local assembly, the council, the mayor, the local administration organization of the work of local government units.

In order for this document to be clear, in a distinct way we explain the meaning of term transparency in this sense to the readers.

By transparency, in this document, we consider the possibility that the interested party (legal or natural person), based on the normative act, or participation in the process, obtain adequate information in a time period in a non-discriminatory (of course, without financial costs) and confidential manner i.e. that information obtained are content relevant and true when it comes to: Initiative of drafting the act; drafting of the act; Before adopting form/proposal of the act ; Creating adopted form of the act, including the adoption process itself; The results of the application of the act or activities stemming from the adopted acts, including information on the treatment of actors whose rights and obligations are laid down in the act.

¹ http://www.opengovpartnership.org/sites/default/files/attachments/leaflet_web.pdf

² Among the examples of good practice to emphasize Hamburg, New York, Amsterdam, Toronto, Hong Kong, http://www.nyc.gov/html/unccp/scp/html/summit/integrity_summit.shtml;

http://www.transparency.org/whatwedo/activity/strengthening_local_government_integrity

³The methodology of several organizations from the Western Balkans, the LOTUS in Croatia and move in Montenegro, which measures the transparency of local governments.

KOSOVO NORTHERN MUNICIPALITIES

North of Kosovo is made up of Serb-majority municipalities and so North Mitrovica, Zvecan, Leposavic and Zubin Potok. These municipalities have behaved differently from other municipalities in Kosovo since the end of the conflict. Dominant Serb population of these municipalities refused all forms of cooperation with the authorities from Pristina, referring to UN 1244, according to which the entire territory of Kosovo (Kosovo and Metohija) is legally part of Serbia until a final solution is reached. Accordingly, these municipalities did not respond to any elections announced by the Kosovo government. Keeping in mind the same attitude, the citizens of these municipalities refused to participate in the 2011 census as well.

The last local elections organized by the Republic of Serbia were held in May 2008 and despite expressed disagreement over their organization, the UNMIK administration recognized the elected municipal leadership in the north and continued to cooperate with them as such.

The Brussels Agreement creates seemingly acceptable conditions for the Serbs living in northern municipalities to come out and elect their municipal representatives. As a result of an agreement between the two sides reached in Brussels, representatives of Serbs from the north of Kosovo begin to register their parties and to get involved in the pre-election campaign.

The population of the north is still largely opposed to holding elections, accompanied by a strong campaign of boycott of the election. Serbia has called on Serbs in northern Kosovo to participate for the first time in Pristina's elections, claiming that elections do not prejudge Kosovo status. Confused and under the influence of a strong boycott campaign, residents of northern municipalities recorded very low turnout. Thus, the turnout in North Mitrovica at 15 : 00 hours was 7% versus the rest of t Kosovo where the turnout was 32% at the same time of the day. Due to an incident caused by the break-up of extremists in several polling stations who were raking boxes with ballot papers, the elections were canceled in three polling stations in North Mitrovica to be repeated on November 17. According to the results of the OSCE, the turnout of voters in other northern municipalities was 22% in Leposavic, 22% in Zubin Potok and 11.21% in Zvecan.

Due to the discussion on the status markings of the declaration that the mayors and councilors of northern municipalities should sign, they refused to sign. In January 2014, a compromise was reached, and mayors and Municipal Assembly members signed solemn declarations without any markings on them, in the premises also with no state markings. The ceremony of signing solemn declaration in four municipalities - North Mitrovica, Zvecan, Zubin Potok and Leposavic was done behind closed doors.

Further work of northern municipalities is marked by their refusal to accept any kind of status markings, which partly was the reason for the lack of official municipal websites. Faced with unrest in the north and constant pressure, local governments did not have enough room for development.

Local elections organized in October 2017 are characterized by high turnout in northern Kosovo and were held without any considerable problem.

Since municipalities in the north of Kosovo functioned in two systems, one according to the applicable legal framework on central and local level, the other according to the laws used in central Serbia, the municipalities and institutions were not fully functional, municipal departments were not established, there was no adequate infrastructure, there were not enough staff, no IT sector neither the IT officers or the PR, and therefore their scope of operations was limited and it was difficult to reach some information.

METHODOLOGY

Aiming at forming a working group for monitoring municipal transparency NGO ACDC has selected reputable partners using selection assessment methods that involved preliminary interviews with the number of organizations from the four municipalities in the north of Kosovo aiming at discovering the interest, existing skills and potential for acquiring skills:

Human Center- North Mitrovica

Light House-North Mitrovica

Inter-Institute for territorial economic development Zubin Potok

North Kosovo-Zubin Potok (expressed willingness to participate)

RTV Mir- Leposavic

Friendship-Leposavic

Business Center- Zvecan

Santa Maria- Zvecan (dealing exclusively with women's rights

Selected organizations got through the sets of training modules required for the implementation of proposed intervention. Taking into consideration complex situation in the northern municipalities the indicators to be monitored were selected and methodology was adjusted to the circumstances in the northern municipalities.

The indicators were divided into eight areas, as measured according to importance or priority for determining the Municipal Transparency Reform Index (hereafter MTRI). Each field contained a series of questions and numerical value was assigned to each of these areas, from 1 to 5 depending on the answers to the questions. MTRI was calculated as the sum of all numerical values obtained on the basis of indicator questions. The working group in each municipality directly observed the development of local self-government, attended meetings of the decision-making bodies, attended public discussions and focus groups. In addition, the researchers were regularly observing the municipal web-site

publications and advertisements posts written down on it, reports, audit reports and other documents. Answers to the questions were collected by observing the municipal official website, media, through direct knowledge, visiting all the cities examined, obtaining information from other bodies such as the Agency for fight against corruption, the Ombudsman Institution, CSOs, journalists, and through conversation with citizens.

In order to ensure triangulation of data working group used a mixed method and so:

- Accessing public documents:

- Contacts and direct interviews with public officials, representatives of the opposition, journalists, representatives of civil society and the private sector;

- Focus groups with public officials, members of Municipal Assemblies, representatives of civil societies, private sector representatives, journalists and other interested parties

Scoring was based on access to information, use of information, mutual communication and accuracy of information. For each result, there was a narrative explanation of the circumstances in which the evaluation took the place. The Working Group reserved the right for the final score of the indicators.

ACDC and partners concluded that, due to very complex situation, during the first year of monitoring and implementation of Municipal Transparency Reform Index there will be no overall score for municipalities but only the score for each indicator.

INDICATORS

Mayor, Municipal Assembly, Directors

- Are the biographies of mayors and directors of public companies / institutions published on the site / other media?

- Are the property list of mayors and directors of public companies / institutions published on the site / other media?

- Are the contact phones mobile / fixed and e-mail addresses available on the website of the Mayor or in other media?

- Is there a designated time when the mayor meets citizens?

- Do directors have communication with the public?

Municipal Assembly

- Does the website contain list of councillors?
- Are the decisions adopted by the Assembly available on the site / other media?
- Are the proposals for consideration by the Assembly available on the site / other media?
- Is there information about contact of citizens with the councilors?
- Is on the site / other media published the agenda for the next session of the Assembly?
- Is the notice of the Meeting to reach out to rural areas?
- Is the presence of the citizens possible at the sessions of the Assembly?

Budget

- Are the current budget and its justification available on the site / other media?
- Are the financial plans of indirect budget users published?
- Is the information on a quarterly budget execution available on the site / other media?
- Is the public call for a debate on the budget published on the site / other media?
- Is the public hearings on the budget held and is it published on the site / other media?
- Is the final budget reviewed?
- Is the last year budget proposal published?
- Is rebalance of the budget publicly discussed and published?

Free access to information

- Are the information on the submission of a request for access to the information visible in the service center (the counter hall) or premises of administration?

- Is the information on filing a request for access to information on the site?

Public procurement, grants and contracts

-Are on the site/ other media information on public procurement?

-Are on the site / other media published information about public procurement in the past 12 months?

- Was the public procurement carried out in accordance with the applicable regulations?

- Are on the site / other media published information on how to select and decide on the composition of the evaluation committee?

- Is there a manual for the tender procedure and the ethical principles of the procedure?
- Are there any data on the winner of the tender on the site / other media?
- Are the contracts with the bid winners available to the public?
- Are the website published reports on the allocation of assets leased?

- Are local governments regularly advertise and call for the lease of the property in its possession?

- Are on the site / other media published information about grants to media?

Public enterprises and public administration

- Are the criteria for the selection of directors of public companies and heads of departments?

- Are on the site / other media published documents of the procedure for selection of directors and head of the department?

- Are on the site / other media published reports of the public companies?
- Is the site / other media publishing job listings?
- Do the companies have a public web site?
- Are on the site / other media public companies publish annual work plans?
- Is on the site / other media published the systematization of public companies?
- Is on the site / other media published price list of a public company?
- Is the systematization of jobs and the number of employees posted on the site / other media?

The relationship with civil society

-Do NGOs attending sessions of Parliament?

-Are there signed memorandums on cooperation with NGOs and whether they are published on the site / other media?

-Are there consultative meetings with representatives of civil society?

-Are on the site published announcements / results of the competition for the allocation of funds to NGOs?

- Are on the website/other media published reports on the implementation of NGO projects funded by the municipality?

Urban planning

- Are on the site / other media information on issues related to urbanism?

- Is the spatial plan published on the site / other media?

- Are master plans published on the site / other media?

- Is on site / other media a list of issued building permits?

- Are decisions and explanations on the issuance of building permits posted on the web site / other media?

- Does municipality has an interactive online map?

- Does municipality has a plan to protect the environment and natural resources management published on the site / other media?

- Are on the site / other media information that the building permits were issued in accordance with the urban plan?

Municipal Property

- Does Administration holds a public register with data on property owned by the municipality and whether it is on site / other media?

- Is there an interactive map with data on property owned by the municipality?

- Are on the site/ other media information about renting or the use of municipal good?

- Is on the site / other media decision on the transfer of municipal property in private?

- Does Municipality has a list of inventory and whether it is published on the site / other media?

- Is there a list of official vehicles and their value and whether it is published on the site / other media?

- Are there data about the municipality owning shares in other companies and whether it is available on the site / other media?

ZUBIN POTOK

Municipal Transparency Reform Index



MAYOR, MUNICIPAL ASSEMBLY, DIRECTORS

The municipality of Zubin Potok has an official website but not functional, which results in the fact that many information are not available to citizens. Thus, biographies and contacts (telephone and e-mail addresses) of the mayors and directors of public companies and institutions cannot be found. The time when the Mayor meets the citizens is determinate for every Friday, and also the citizens of the municipality of Zubin Potok have the opportunity to communicate with directors of public companies or institutions by direct contact or going to the company or institution. Official phones of the mayor, directors of public companies are available to citizens, but they are usually answered by a secretary. Phone numbers of municipal assembly members are not available to citizens. Property lists of the mayors, directors and councilors were published only on the website of the Anti-Corruption Agency.

When it comes to the work of the Assembly and councilors, the list of councilors of the municipality of Zubin Potok exists only on the website of the Central Election Commission (CEC), proposals for consideration at the Assembly sessions, and the decisions of the Assembly are announced on the bulletin board in the Municipality for several days. Although citizens are

allowed to attend the Assembly sessions, the number of those attending is very small, due to ignorance of that right, which is due to lack of awareness. Namely, notices on the holding of the session of the Assembly, as well as the agenda, are distributed to councilors on private e-mails, as well as to organizations regularly monitoring the Assembly meetings such as UNMIK, OSCE, LMT and civil society organizations that have expressed interest in monitoring assembly sessions. Announcements are also announced on the bulletin board and in local media, so the information on the Assembly session reaches those living in rural areas.

The mayor, directors and members of the assembly regularly respond to and participate in public debates of civil society organizations.

Conclusion: Transparency of mayor's work, work of directors and members of the Assembly at a satisfactory level. The decision-making process in the municipal assembly is open to citizens and organizations.

Recommendations: Continue with the practice of a particular day for the reception of citizens by the Mayor. Establish a mechanism for direct contact of citizens with representatives of the assembly and directors of public enterprises.

INDEX: 3.2 Good

BUDGET

The budget proposal and its explanation could not be found on the municipal website due to the lack of a website. Another circumstance that makes the budget interesting is that the budget is not determined in the municipality according to the proposal and priorities, but the final amount is obtained from the Ministry of Finance, determined on a flat basis with the explanation, as local authorities state that in the census was not conducted in the north, and that is the reason the budget is determinate based on approximate estimation.

The amount of budget received from the Pristina government is published on local media but its distribution is not.

The proposal for the final account for the previous year was presented as a point of the agenda at the session of the Assembly, and discussed after that. For the year 2018, a public debate on the budget was held, which was announced in local media, but the participation of citizens in the discussion was invisible. The budget rebalance was also proposed as the agenda item at the session of the Municipal Assembly of Zubin Potok, but there was not much discussion about them because of the poor response of the citizens. Due to the lack of functionality of the official website of the municipality of Zubin Potok, the budget, financial plans of indirect beneficiaries,

information on quarterly execution of the budget, calls for public debate on the budget, and similar information related to the budget of the municipality of Zubin Potok are published only on the bulletin board in the Municipality for several days, but according to the representatives of the civil sector, information can be obtained on request.

Conclusion: The amount of the budget is known to citizens and interested parties, budget discussions are public, and in this sense this indicator is positively determined. When it comes to information related to budget spending reporting, the conclusion is that they are half published in local media and that the transparency of spending is not at a satisfactory level.

Recommendations: Activating the official website of the municipality or finding some other possibilities for obtaining information in accordance with the law; increase calls to local media to report on the topic of this indicator.

INDEX 2.6 Satisfactory

FREE ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Information or notices on the way how to submit a request for access to public document do not exist in the municipality building. Notice of the way of submitting a request or obtaining information can be obtained at the request of the reception desk at the Municipality. Since the site of the municipality of Zubin Potok is not in operation, therefore, there are no data on the submission of requests for access to information.

Conclusion: Fairly low awareness of free access to information. Suspiciousness of the receptionist was noticed when checking the possibility of obtaining information of public importance. Uncertainty about what information is of public importance.

Recommendations: Place instructions for seeking information of documents o public interest on noticeable place. Education of employees on this issue is desirable, as well as raising citizens' awareness of the right to access information.

INDEX: 2.6 Satisfactory

PUBLIC PROCUREMENTS, DONATIONS AND CONTRACTS

Due to the lack of functionality of the official municipal website, information on public procurements is published on the bulletin board in the municipality building, for several days. Public procurement data in the last 12 months are also published on the bulletin board. The sources used for this research claim that public procurements are carried out in accordance with applicable regulations.

On the website of the Public Procurement Regulatory Commission, where all public procurements are published in Kosovo, data can only be obtained with prior registration, and they are complete and comprehensive when it comes to this municipality.

There is no information on the method of selecting the members of the evaluation committee and on the manner in which the commission decides on the tender winner despite the existence of the instructions for tender procedures and the ethical principles of the procedure itself. The information on the winner of the tender are published on the bulletin board, and the contracts with the tender winners could be made available to the public only with the Request for access to public documents.

There is no available information on the leasing of municipal property, or on any public call for leasing municipal property. According to the words of municipal officials municipality does not own property.

Due to the previously limited budget of the municipality of Zubin Potok there are no funds to support the work of the media.

Conclusion: The public procurement process is quite transparent comparing to the other municipalities but not at satisfactory level; Noticeable willingness among local government officials to improve transparency in this part.

Recommendations: Considering that this indicator is especially observed in the fight against corruption, the recommendations to the local authorities are that due to the lack of an official website, information should be published on the bulletin board: all data on the evaluation commission, all data on tender winners, all contracts with tender winners, data on the leasing of municipal property and lease agreements. The recommendation is that this information is on the bulletin board until the site of the official website of Zubin Potok municipality is functional, and in any case not less than one year from the date of publication.

INDEX: 2.8 Satisfactory

PUBLIC ENTERPRISES AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

There are criteria for the selection of directors of public companies and head of the departments, but the documents related to the selection procedures of the director and the chief of the department are published only on the bulletin board. Public companies in the municipality of Zubin Potok do not have their own websites, so there are no published annual work plans, nor reports on their work. Such information is only available with the request for access to public documents, while in most cases the price list of public service companies is published on bulletin boards of respective company. Directors have not yet been selected in this municipality.

The systematization of public enterprises, as well as the systematization of jobs and the number of employees, are not published anywhere, but are available with the attached request for access to information of public interest.

The criteria and method of scoring candidates in for employment in municipal enterprises are inaccessible to the public so far, but is should be taken into consideration that in this municipality there was not job vacancies yet.

Conclusion: There is plenty of room for improvement in terms of transparent work. Insufficiently transparent annual work plans and reports on the work of municipal companies and bodies. Unknown composition of the commission and the way of scoring for employment.

Recommendations: To publish annual work plans in the media and on bulletin boards. To publish on the bulletin board the scoring method and the composition of the commission when determining the candidate for the job once job vacancies are on.

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

RELATIONS WITH THE CIVIL SOCIETY

Municipality Zubin Potok has relations with civil society on an enviable level. Assembly sessions are open to civil society organizations, and in addition, organizations regularly monitoring Assembly sessions are regularly informed of sessions. Municipality Zubin Potok has signed Memoranda of cooperation with NGOs and other civil society organizations not only from the territory of the municipality but also from the other places. These memoranda are not published on the media, except on the websites of some organizations that have memoranda, but with the request for access to public document, they are available for inspection. Meetings with representatives of civil society are held as needed, but according to civil society representatives, they can be easily scheduled. On the other hand, the municipality of Zubin Potok does not have enough funds to finance the non-governmental sector, unless the municipality and NGOs have a joint project. In this case, since the official site of the Municipality of Zubin Potok is not in operation, all information related to the project implementation can be found on the bulletin board, web sites of organizations, on the social networks of these NGOs and / or on the websites of electronic media (KoSSev, Radio Mitrovica Sever, Radio Kolasin, TV Most, etc.).

Conclusion: Taking into account that the Municipality of Zubin Potok does not have the financial means to support civil society organizations, the relationship in terms of providing any other support is very satisfactory. There is space for improving the transparency of work with civil organizations.

Recommendations: After each memorandum of understanding or support letters, go to the media with announcement until the final launch of the municipal web site and then publish all the information on the site.

INDEX 3.8 Good

URBAN PLANNING

In the absence of an official municipal website, all information related to urban planning - spatial plans, urban plans, a list of issued building permits, decisions and explanations on the issuance of building permits, as well as information on whether the issued building permits are in accordance with the urban plan, and so on, are available through to the Request for Access to Public documents.

As stated in the municipality, the interactive map of the Municipality of Zubin Potok is being prepared. Municipality has no environmental protection plan, but its design is planned.

Conclusion: Very low transparency of this indicator, taking into account the importance and position of Zubin Potok as a municipality with the only serious water resource and great potential for tourism development.

Recommendations: To publish all issued building permits on the bulletin board in the absence of electronic means of information. To apply for funding for the development of the Local Environmental Action Plan with the competent agencies and start developing the plan by transparent engagement of the most eminent domestic experts. To finish the interactive map.

INDEX 2.6 Satisfactory

MUNICIPAL PROPERTY

According to the municipal officials, there is no public register of municipal property because the Municipality of Zubin Potok, which functions under the laws and system of Kosovo, has no property in its possession. There is no interactive map with information about municipal property, as well as information on the use of municipal property. Therefore, municipal property cannot be changed and privately owned, nor leased. Also, it has not happened before that municipal property becomes private.

At the end of each year there is an inventory list, which is then published on a bulletin board for several months. In addition, the inventory list is available for review of the request for access public documents. Municipality Zubin Potok does not have shares in other companies, and the

property owned by municipal companies is fully on disposal to these companies. The list of municipal vehicles and their values is not publicly announced.

Conclusion: Quite unclear situation since it is obvious that municipality has some property starting from building itself, vehicles and furniture. However, in the Kosovo system these items were not registered to be property of the municipality.

Recommendations : To develop interactive map for municipal property, to make a list of municipal vehicles and their values and place on bulletin board until the municipal website become functional.

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

NORTH MITROVICA

Municipal Transparency Reform Index Report



MAYOR, MUNICIPAL ASSEMBLY, DIRECTORS

Municipality of North Mitrovica has no official website, according to explanation from the municipal employee the website was abolished by central government in Pristina, so it is not possible to get data such as biographies and contacts of the mayors and other public functions. The only available information about the mayor and directors of public companies are those that are highlighted within the property cards published on the Anti-Corruption Agency website. In the municipality of North Mitrovica, there is practice of scheduling terms in which the mayor receives citizens from 08-16 h. Directors of public companies has not scheduled time to meet with citizens.

It is worth noting that the municipality of North Mitrovica has an administrative office led by the Chief Executive Officer.

The Municipal Assembly of North Mitrovica, according to the Kosovo legal system, has 19 councilors, and after the election process, the list of all the councilors was published on the

website of the Central Election Commission, and the list of councilors was published in a number of local media. The sessions of the Municipal Assembly of North Mitrovica are, in most cases, open to the public, which is announced through the media, as well as the agenda and points of the agenda. This way of informing about holding a session of the Assembly has no problem in reaching all interested citizens, taking into consideration that in the area of North Mitrovica there are not so many rural areas. The sources of information are mostly some local commercial radio stations without informative program.

Decisions approved by the Assembly can generally be heard by attending meetings or by reading on local media portals, depending on the actuality and significance of the approved decisions. There is no continuity in reporting in one place, primarily because of the lack of an official municipal website. Also, there is no data on whether and to what extent citizens are addressing to councilors for solving certain problems or presenting some suggestions of importance for improving the quality of life of the citizens of this municipality

Conclusion: Transparency of work of Mayor, Chief Executive Officer, directors and members of the Assembly at a satisfactory level. The decision-making process in the municipal assembly is open to citizens and organizations.

Recommendations: Increase cooperation with media and promote the establishment of municipal web page, and informing citizens about the work of municipalities through social media network

INDEX: 2.8 Satisfactory

BUDGET

Municipality of North Mitrovica respects the deadlines for approving the annual budget. After approval, the budget is published on the website of the Ministry of Finance of Kosovo. The report of the Assembly on the adoption of the budget for 2018 is available in local media. Reports on the quarterly execution of the budget both for the current and the previous years are available on the website of the Ministry of Finance of Kosovo. On the same site, however, the publication of the financial plans of indirect budget users was omitted. In the municipality of North Mitrovica, public sessions on budgets are being planned, and for 2018 it was held in September, and the report from the session of the Assembly was published in the media. The final budget for the previous year was discussed publicly and report was published in media. In the municipality of North Mitrovica, the situation is the same and when it comes to the budget rebalance, which was publicly discussed, and announced through some media (TV Most, Mreza).

Conclusion: The degree of transparency of this complex indicator is at satisfactory level, despite taking into account the lack of a municipal website. Positively is assessed timely information of civil society organizations on Assembly sessions on budget and the fact that report from a public session on the budget was published in the media.

Recommendations: To publish on the media financial plans of indirect beneficiaries and information on quarterly execution of the budget. Start a campaign to increase citizen participation in budget discussions. Archive data so it can be instantly uploaded to the site once it is in place

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

FREE ACCESS TO INFORMATION

In the municipality of North Mitrovica, as in most municipalities in Kosovo, there is a certain amount of non-transparency and unavailability when it comes to information of public interest. However, in the municipality of North Mitrovica there is no procedure for obtaining public document. When the citizens of the municipality of North Mitrovica need some data that are not published on the media available to them, the easiest way to do it is through email addressing to the Chief Executive Officer. Citizens, however, do not know how to access this process, because information about submitting requests for access to information is not visible in the service center or in the premises of the Management Board. Consequently, there is no data on already submitted requests for access to information.

Conclusion: There is a practice that citizens and CSOs directly ask Chief Executive Officer for access to public documents which could be a good practice in the given circumstances but the fact is that there is no official procedure or guidance on how to submit request.

Recommendations: To put on a noticeable place the instructions for seeking access to public documents. Desirable education of employees on this issue, and raising citizens' awareness of the right to free access to information.

INDEX: 2.8 Satisfactory

PUBLIC PROCUREMENTS, DONATIONS AND CONTRACTS

In Kosovo, there is a Public Procurement Regulatory Commission, which publishes all public procurements for the entire territory of Kosovo. As the municipality of North Mitrovica does not have its official website, the data can only be found on this portal with prior registration of users. On this portal, information can also be found on public procurement for previous periods and not only for the current year. Also, on this portal there is also an instruction that refers to tender procedures and ethical principles of the procedure itself.

In the municipality of North Mitrovica, public procurements are carried out in accordance with applicable regulations. Data on winners of the tender should be available on the portal of the Public Procurement Regulatory Commission. It is noticeable that on this portal and in other

means of information, there is no information on how to select members and how to decide on the composition of the evaluation committee but the practice is that the members of commission were appointed just before the session in order to avoid possible pressure. Municipality of North Mitrovica does not own the property so contract on lease of property do not exist. Municipality of North Mitrovica does not have means for media support.

Conclusion: Transparency of this indicator was based on the information that people could obtain form the Portal of Public Procurement Regulatory Commission and the impression is that citizens were not well informed well about the tenders and contracts.

Recommendation: In the absence of the municipal official website use media for publishing the criteria for selection of commission for assessment of tender documentation, generally use media for informing citizens about public procurement, donations and contracts.

INDEX 2.6 Satisfactory

PUBLIC ENTERPRISES AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

The municipality of North Mitrovica still does not have all the 14 departments as stipulated by the Statute. For now, there are only 7 functional departments with their own chiefs. The administration inherited from the Administrative Office of North Mitrovica that appointed them in accordance with the valid criteria of that time .When it comes to reports on the work of public companies, the municipality of Mitrovica does not deal with their publication since due to the specific situation and until-recently dual system.

Unite of local self-government North Mitrovica was established after the Brussels Agreement and there is still a need for recruitment of new staff. The local self-government announced job vacancies in certain media and on bulletin boards in the offices of the Municipal Administration of North Mitrovica.

Public companies operating in this municipality face numerous problems and do not keep up with the innovations in the business, so they do not have active websites. Also, neither their annual work plans nor the changes occurring in their organizational structures regarding job classification are published. About the pricelist of services of public enterprises it is possible to obtain information exclusively by direct visit to the company where the price lists were placed on bulletin boards, and by submitting a query on the price list.

Conclusion: Taking into consideration recent political event and integration into Kosovo system we will estimate this indicator as satisfactory in spite of insufficiently transparent annual work plans and reports on the work of municipal companies and bodies. Characteristic is the failure to publish the annual work plans of the entrepreneurs as well as the non-disclosure of the price list of services.

Recommendations: Publish annual work plans in the media and on bulletin boards. On the bulletin board, publish the scoring method and the composition of the commission when determining the candidate for the job. Make websites of public companies.

INDEX 2.6 Satisfactory

RELATIONS WITH THE CIVIL SOCIETY

Given that there are a large number of active NGOs in the municipality of North Mitrovica, it is very often that their representatives are present and follow the Assembly sessions. Certain NGOs have signed Memoranda of Cooperation with Local Self-Government, and information can be found on the official Internet or Facebook pages of NGOs, but not the text of the Memorandum of Cooperation. Cooperation of local government of North Mitrovica with NGOs is at a high level. An initiative was also undertaken by the local self-government to hold a joint meeting with representatives of NGOs to discuss their future cooperation. In the local media, it is possible to find notifications that the local self-government calls for the allocation of funds to NGOs. Competition results are published in the media and directly communicated with NGOs. Information on projects funded by local governments is published by NGOs, in the media as well as on their official websites, in particular by promoting good results.

Conclusion: The relationship that North Mitrovica municipality has with civil society organizations and the transparency of these relations at a satisfactory level. Transparency in the allocation of funds to NGOs and the provision of any other support is very satisfactory.

Recommendations: After each memorandum of understanding or support letters, go to the notice media until the final launch of the site and then publish all the information on the site.

INDEX 3.2 Good

URBAN PLANNING

Urban planning is an integral part of the work of each local government. In the municipality of North Mitrovica, releases are issued only on the construction of some larger facilities and the organization of urban areas. Regarding spatial plans, they exist from some earlier periods but the new spatial plan and urban plan are in the process of development.

As in the other municipalities in the North of Kosovo, as well as in North Mitrovica there is a problem of issuing building permits which is being overcome through cooperation with the relevant ministry. For the time being, various modalities for their issuance are found, so that there is no information available on the decisions related to the issuance of construction permits. Although we live in an era of information and modern technology, the municipality of North

Mitrovica does not have a developed interactive online map, which could be used by a large number of citizens.

Conclusion: The lack of spatial plans is certainly a problem for a city where practice, due to the known political security situation, the raising of buildings without issued building permits is a problem that this and every future authority will face. The same applies to the urban plan.

Recommendations: To publish spatial and urban plans when publicly available on public media. Publish lists of issued building permits on local media

INDEX 2.5 Neutral

MUNICIPAL PROPERTY

There is a major problem of ownership of property in the municipality of North Mitrovica. Only the municipality has information about its ownership, although these data have not been published anywhere and an interactive map with data on municipal property ownership has not been created. When it comes to renting and using municipal property, the municipality of Mitrovica does not share this information with the public through official means of information. Decisions on the transfer of the property municipality, as well as the inventory list, are not announced by the municipality. Some information about this, such as List of official vehicles can be found in audit reports published at the end of each year. The information about whether a municipality owns some shares in other companies is not available in the media.

Due to inadequate education of the municipal servants the municipality has marked its property by Bar Codes and in the cooperation with the ministry of Public Administration working on placing this information on the website of Kosovo Property Agency (E-Property).

Conclusion: Weak level of transparency of municipal property data.

Recommendations: Create an interactive map and a public property register owned by the municipality and publish it on the media, and after the final launch of the official site of the municipality of Mitrovica North, publish them. Publish a list of cars in municipal ownership and amounts of their values.

INDEX: 2.5 Neutral

LEPOSAVIC

Municipal Transparency Reform Index Report



MAYOR, MUNICIPAL ASSEMBLY, DIRECTORS

The municipality of Leposavic does not have a functional official website, which results in the fact that much information is not available to citizens. Biographies, contact phones and e-mail address of the mayor and director of public enterprises and institutions are not available to citizens. The time when the Mayor meets the citizens is determined and it is on Thursdays. Citizens of Leposavic municipality are not in a position to communicate with directors of public companies or institutions because there are no clear procedures for contact with them. Property lists of the mayor and directors of public enterprises / institutions can be found on the website of the Anti-Corruption Agency. It should be emphasized that communication on the relation Mayor-Assembly was very law in the former period so the transparency of some municipal work was questionable. During the observation of the transparency of the municipality of Leposavic, after the elections organized in October 2017, a new ruling majority was formed and the new Mayor was elected and it seems that the situation is improved.

The list of municipal councilors of Leposavic municipality exists only on the website of the Central Election Commission (CEC), the proposals for consideration at the Assembly and the decisions of the Assembly are published on the bulletin board in the Municipality for several days. Citizens are allowed to attend the Assembly sessions and citizens use their rights, but not in

such a large number. Notices on holding the session of the Assembly, as well as the agenda, are distributed to councilors on private e-mails and published on the bulletin board, and are often published on TV MIR, and it can be assumed that most of the citizens are well informed. Regarding the transparency of the work of the assembly, RTV MIR directly conveys all the assembly sessions, so all decisions made by the assembly are transparent through direct broadcasts. It is worth noting that the Policy on Granting Subsidies is published on RTV MIR.

Conclusion: Transparency of the work of the mayor and the assembly at a satisfactory level mostly thanks to the RTV MIR that regularly conveys the sessions and announces the decisions taken by the municipal authorities.

Recommendations: Improve the transparency of the work of directors and municipal services.

INDEX: 3.4 Good

BUDGET

As Leposavic municipality does not have a functional official website, the budget and its explanation could not be published on it, however, the budget and its explanation cannot be found in any other means of information. The financial plans of indirect budget users have not been released anywhere. Quarterly budget information cannot be found on any media. The good side is the fact that the public call for a budget debate is published in the media, which enables interested citizens to take part in the discussion. Public discussion on the budget for 2018 was held and was broadcast directly to the MIR television. The final budget account has not been publicly considered until the completion of this report. Also, the draft budget statement has not been published or the budget rebalance has been publicly discussed.

Conclusion: Insufficient transparency in budget planning and spending, especially with indirect budget users. The conclusion is that the new management has a hearing for proposals that improve the transparency of budgeting of municipal services and authorities.

Recommendations: Take steps to increase the transparency of budget expenditures when it comes to indirect beneficiaries, to improve public awareness of budget-related activities.

INDEX 2.0 Low

FREE ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Information on how to apply for access to information is available on request at the reception desk in the Municipality. There are no instructions on how to apply for access to information of public importance in visible places. There is noticeable insecurity on the side of citizens to access

information of pubic importance. The Leposavic Municipality site is not operational, and therefore there are no published data on submitting requests for access to information.

Conclusion: Access to information of public importance is possible on request. There is no register on how many requests were submitted on yearly level

Recommendations: Put a noticeable place on the instructions for seeking information of public importance. Desirable education of employees on this issue, and raising citizens' awareness of the right to access information.

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

PUBLIC PROCUREMENTS, DONATIONS AND CONTRACTS

Some of the public procurement information is published on the bulletin board in the municipality building, for several days, as well as data on public procurement in the last 12 months. The sources used for this research claim that public procurement is not conducted in accordance with applicable regulations and that the public procurement process is completely non-transparent. On the website of the Public Procurement Regulatory Commission, where all public procurements in Kosovo are published, the data can only be obtained with the prior registration and then they are incomplete.

Despite the existence of instructions for tender procedures, no information can be found on any information about how to select and decide on the composition of the evaluation committee. The information on the winner of the tender shall be published on the notice board, and the contracts with the tender winners shall be made available to the public only on the request for access to public documents. Leposavic municipality does not finance the media due to budget constraints.

Conclusion: Transparency of tender procedures at a very low level despite the existence of instructions. Non-transparent donations and contracts signed by the municipality with third parties.

Recommendations: In the absence of a functional official municipal website, use the media to publish the method of selecting a commission for the evaluation of tender documents, generally use the media for the purpose of informing citizens about public procurement, donations and contracts.

INDEX 2.0 Low

PUBLIC ENTERPRISES AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

Criteria for the selection of directors of public companies and head of the department have been established, but documents regarding the selection procedures of the director and chief of the department are not published anywhere, only the announcement decisions are announced on the bulletin board. Public companies in Leposavić municipality do not have their own websites, so that annual work plans are not published, nor reports on their work. Such information is only available with the request for access to public document. Price list of public enterprise services are published on bulletin board of the companies.

The systematization of public enterprises, as well as the systematization of jobs and the number of employees, have not been published, but are available with the attached request for access to public documents. Job vacations were posted on the bulletin board and RTV MIR but the criteria for selection of commission for job vacancies are unknown.

Conclusion: Insufficient transparency in the selection of public enterprise directors and systematization of workplaces.

Recommendations: Publish documents related to the selection procedures of directors on the notice board and in the media. The systematization of public enterprises and workplaces should be announced on the notice board of the assembly or in a visible place and in the building of the assembly until the launch of the official municipal website.

INDEX 2.4 Neutral

RELATIONS WITH THE CIVIL SOCIETY

According to the words of the civil society organizations, Leposavic Municipality has fairly good relations with them. However, the signed memoranda of cooperation with NGOs have not been published on any media, but with the request for access to information are available for inspection.

Meetings of representatives of civil society with local authorities, primarily the mayor and members of the assembly, are held as needed and it does not take long to schedule a meeting. However, at the time of writing this report, the Municipality of Leposavic did not fund civil society activities due to the lack of funding for the NGO sector. In the event that the municipality has a joint project with the civil society organization, since the official website of the Municipality of Leposavic is not in operation, all information related to the project implementation can be found on the bulletin board, websites or sites on the social networks of these NGOs, or published by RTV MIR. When it comes to the session of the Municipal Assembly of Leposavic, there are members of some NGOs following sessions.

Conclusion: Taking into account that the Municipality of Leposavic does not have the financial means to support civil society organizations, the relationship that it has in terms of providing any

other support and transparency of it is very satisfactory. There is room for improvement of work with civil organizations.

Recommendations: After each memorandum of understanding or support letters, go to the media with it until the final launch of the website and then publish all the information on the website.

INDEX 3.6 Good

URBAN PLANNING

Given that the Municipality of Leposavic does not have an official functional website, there is no possibility of insight online. Leposavic Municipality also does not have an interactive online map. Spatial plans and urban plans have not been published on any media. The list of issued building permits has not been publicly announced, as well as decisions and explanations on issuing construction permits. Certificates of issued building permits in accordance with the urban plan are available with the Request for access to public document.

Conclusion: Very low level of transparency.

Recommendations: Publish spatial and urban plans on the media and make citizens familiar with the way how to reach them. Publish a list of issued building permits as a public document.

INDEX 2 Low

MUNICIPAL PROPERTY

The Municipality of Leposavic does not have a Public Register of Municipal Property because, as we get an explanation, the municipalities are young and have no property in its possession. These allegations are being challenged by civil society organizations and the media claiming that the municipality owns the building, the vehicle and was the founder of some enterprises. There is no interactive map with information about municipal property, as well as information on the use of municipal property. According to different sources of information, municipal property did not happen to become private, so there was no public information on it.

The list of inventory is done at the end of each year and is published on the bulletin board for several days. In addition, the inventory list is available for review on the request for access to public documents. Leposavic municipality has no shares in other companies. The list of vehicles and their values is not available to the public or published in the media.

Conclusion: The municipal property is not precisely defined, and the lack of an interactive map with municipal property data raises a number of questions.

Recommendations: The create an interactive map or public register of municipal property as soon as possible and publish it in the media. Publish a list of municipal vehicles and their values. After making the website, make all the data transparent.

INDEX 2.5 Neutral

ZVECAN

Municipal Transparency reform Index Report



MUNICIPALITY, MUNICIPAL ASSEMBLY, DIRECTORS

Municipality of Zvecan has an official website which, however it is not functional, which results in the fact that many information are not available to citizens. Thus, biographies and contacts (telephone and e-mail addresses) of the mayors and directors of public enterprises and institutions cannot be found on any informative media. The time when the mayor meets citizens is not exactly determined, it is usually on Fridays but by a simple physical check we found that this does not happen every Friday. Citizens of Zvecan municipality are not in a position to communicate with the directors of public companies or institutions. Enterprises and institutions that exist in Zvecan municipality either work according to the Serbian system or are in the process of integration. Property lists of the mayor and directors of public enterprises / institutions are published only on the website of the Anti-Corruption Agency.

There is an operational website called E-Municipality Zvecan, which can be tracked at http://www.eopstinazvecan.com/, but due to the fact that the site is under the administration of a

civil society organization remains an open question whether it is the most desirable way for official publication of information of legally elected local authorities?

When it comes to the work of the Assembly and councilors, the list of councilors of the Municipality of Zvecan exists only on the website of the Central Election Commission (CEC), the proposals for consideration at the Assembly and the decisions of the Assembly are announced on the bulletin board in the Municipality for several days. Although citizens are allowed to attend the Assembly sessions, the number of those attending is very small, due to ignorance of that right, which is due to lack of awareness. Namely, notices on the holding of the session of the Assembly, as well as the agenda, are forwarded to councilors on private e-mails and are published only on the bulletin board, and thus hardly or completely do not reach citizens living in rural areas. If it is published on the media, then it is on the very day of the session.

Conclusion: Transparency of the bearer of functions in the Municipality of Zvecan at tolerable level as well as the transparency of the work of municipal directors and members of the assembly. Communicating with government authorities is possible. Advertising mode is very poorly visible.

Recommendations: To publish ways of contacting mayors, directors and members of the assembly. More frequent appearance in the media and provision of information through media appearances is recommended. Timely information on assembly meetings through the media is advised in order to make citizens to be able to attend.

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

BUDGET

The proposal for the final account for the previous year was presented as the agenda item at the session of the Assembly, after which a public debate on the budget for 2018 was held, held in the presence of some civil society organizations and interested citizens. The budget rebalance was also proposed as the agenda item at the session of the SO Zvecan, but there was little discussion about them because of the poor response of the citizens, although the call was public and timely sent. Due to the lack of functionality of the official website of Zvecan Municipality, the budget, financial plans of indirect beneficiaries, information on quarterly budget execution, calls for public budget debate, and similar information related to the budget of the municipality of Zvecan, are published only on the bulletin board in the municipality for several days.

Conclusion: As a very popular indicator, the degree of transparency is quite low, despite taking into account the lack of a municipal website. It is positively assessed informing of civil society organizations on budget sessions.

Recommendations: To publish in the media financial plans of indirect beneficiaries and information on quarterly execution of the budget. Start a campaign to increase citizen participation in budget discussions. Archive data so that it can be instantly uploaded to the site once it is in place.

INDEX: 2.8 Satisfactory

FREE ACCESS TO INFORMATION

There are no explanations or instructions on how to apply for access to information of public e. Information on submitting requests for access to public documents is available on request at the reception desk in the Municipality. By check, the impression is that employees at the municipal reception desk do not know enough about the procedure itself and citizens' rights to access to information. The site of Zvecan Municipality is not in function, and therefore there are no published data on submitting requests for access to information.

Conclusion. It is possible to get access to public documents but the lack of knowledge of staff to address requests for free access to information is noticeable. There is a possibility of obtaining information of public interest on request with a preliminary explanation.

Recommendations: Educate staff about citizens' rights to access to public documents and establish procedure on it.

INDEX: 2.6 Satisfactory

PUBLIC PROCUREMENTS, DONATIONS AND CONTRACTS

Due to the lack of functionality of the official municipal website, information on public procurements is published on the bulletin board in the municipality building, for several days. The same applies to public procurement data in the last 12 months. The sources used for this research claim that public procurements are carried out in accordance with applicable regulations.

On the website of the Public Procurement Regulatory Commission, where all public procurements in Kosovo are published, the data can only be obtained with the prior registration and then they are incomplete and halfway.

Although there is an instruction for tender procedures and ethical principles of the procedure itself, no information can be found on any media on procedure for selection and decision on the composition of the evaluation committee. The information on the winner of the tender shall be published on the notice board, and the contracts with the tender winners shall be made available to the public only with the Request for access to public documents.

According to the officials of the municipality of Zvecan, there is a program in which a call for leasing property that is in municipal ownership is declared, but it is not stated what the program is. Also, there are no published rental lease reports. When it comes to financing the media, Zvecan Municipality does not finance the media due to budget constraints.

Conclusion: Transparency of tender procedures at a very low level despite the existence of instructions. Non-transparent donations and contracts signed by the municipality with third parties. Positive evaluation of the announcement of the winners of the tender on the bulletin board;

Recommendations: In the absence of a functional official municipal website, use the media to publish the method of selecting a commission for the evaluation of tender documents, generally use the media for the purpose of informing citizens about public procurement, donations and contracts.

INDEX 2.5 neutral

PUBLIC ENTERPRISES AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

There are criteria for selecting directors of public companies and head of the department, but the documents related to the selection procedures of the director and the chief of the department are published only on the bulletin board, due to the lack of website. Public companies in Zvecan municipality do not have their own websites, so there are no published annual work plans, nor reports on their work. Such information is only available with the request for access to public documents, while the price list for the use of public enterprises is published on the bulletin board of enterprises themselves.

The systematization of public enterprises, as well as the systematization of jobs and the number of employees, have not been published, but are available with the attached request for access to public documents. Job vacancies are posted on the bulletin board and in local media (TV Most, Contact plus radio, Radio Mitrovica, KosSev, etc.).

Conclusion: Satisfactory transparency of procedures for the selection of directors and heads of departments in given conditions and the lack of an official municipal website.

Recommendations: Use a bulletin board to publish the number of employees in the municipality and municipal services, as well as systematization of jobs until the final establishment of the municipality's website.

INDEX 2.6 Satisfactory

RELATIONS WITH THE CIVIL SOCIETY

The municipality of Zvecan has signed Memoranda of cooperation with individual NGOs, which are not published on any media, but are available with the request for access to public documents. Meetings with representatives of civil society are held as needed. However, the municipality of Zvecan does not have sufficient funds to finance the NGO sector, unless the municipality and NGOs have a joint project. In this case, since the official site of the Municipality of Zvecan is not in operation, all information related to the implementation of the project can be found on the unofficial Facebook page of the Municipality of Zvecan, websites or sites on the social networks of these NGOs, and on the websites of electronic media (KoSSev, Radio Mitrovica Sever, etc.). When it comes to the sessions of the Assembly of the Municipality of Zvecan, there are members of some NGOs regularly monitoring Assembly sessions.

Conclusion: Satisfactory transparency of relations with civil society in the given circumstances.

Recommendations: Continue transparent work on strengthening civil society and transparent cooperation with the non-governmental sector. Equally treat all civil society organizations without favoring individuals.

INDEX 3.2 Good

URBAN PLANNING

Since the official site of the Municipality of Zvecan is not in operation, all information related to urbanism - spatial plans, urban plans, list of issued building permits, decisions and explanations on issuing building permits, whether the issued building permits are in accordance with the urban plan, etc., are available with the Request for access to public documents, and in some cases they are briefly published on the bulletin board in the Municipality. It is worth noting that to get information from urbanism is very easy.

According to the municipal official, the interactive map of the municipality of Zvecan is under preparation, and also, the municipality has an environmental protection plan, which, however, has not been published anywhere. The selection procedure for the development of the Local Ecological Action Plan was not transparent according to sources from the non-governmental sector.

Conclusion: A rather low transparency rate when it comes to publishing urban plans, and the method of deciding on the issuance of building permits.

Recommendations: Facilitate procedures for insight into urban plans, publish an environmental protection plan on social media.

INDEX 2.8 Satisfactory

MUNICIPAL PROPERTY

"The public register of municipal property does not exist because the municipality of Zvecan, which operates under the laws and system of Kosovo, is young and has no property in its possession," the municipality's representatives claim. Therefore, there is no interactive map with data on municipal property ownership, as well as information on the use of municipal property. A simple check found that MTS Bank is functioning in the premises of the municipal assembly!

According to the majority of sources, it has not happened even before that municipal property becomes private.

At the end of each year an inventory list is made which is published on a notice board for several days. In addition, the inventory list is available for review of the request for access to information of public importance. Municipality Zvecan has no shares in other companies.

The lists of municipal vehicles and their values are not published anywhere.

Conclusion: The impression is that the municipal property is not precisely defined and the lack of an interactive map with municipal property data raises a number of questions.

Recommendations: To create an interactive map or a public register of municipal property and publish it. To make a list of municipal owned vehicles with its values and publish it.

INDEX 2.2 Neutral